

Senior Police National Assessment Centre 2009

national **AGENCY** POLICING

Results and Analysis Report Executive Summary

November 2009

© NPIA (National Policing Improvement Agency) 2009

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, modified, amended, stored in any retrieval system or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior written permission of the National Policing Improvement Agency or its representative.

For additional copies, or to enquire about the content of the document, please contact NPIA Examinations and Assessment on (01423) 876941 or email SeniorSelection@npia.pnn.police.uk.

For copyright specific enquiries, please telephone the NPIA National Police Library on (01256) 602650.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The Senior Police National Assessment Centre (Senior PNAC) 2009 was delivered from 13 September to 28 September at NPIA Bramshill.
2. Sir Hugh Orde, as the Senior PNAC Service Director, was responsible for overseeing the design and delivery of the Senior PNAC process. As part of this role, he attended and assumed the role of Service Director for Intake 2 of this year's Senior PNAC. Chief Constables Steve House (Strathclyde Police) and Barbara Wilding (South Wales Police) attended and fulfilled the role of Service Co-Director for Intake 1 and Intake 3 respectively. The Service Director and Co-Directors were supported for the duration of Senior PNAC by Ciaran McGuigan (Senior PNAC Non Service Director) and members of the NPIA, Examinations & Assessment Business Unit.
3. The strategic interests of the different Police Authorities from across the four jurisdictions (England, Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales) were represented through the attendance of the following appointed Associate Directors; Paul Deneen (West Mercia Police Authority), Brian Sangha (Kent Police Authority), Susan Hughes (Essex Police Authority), Sir Desmond Rae (Northern Ireland Policing Board), Ian Blake (Dumfries and Galloway Police, Fire and Rescue Committee) and Iain Whyte (Lothian and Borders Policing Board) across the three intakes.
4. 89 candidates attended Senior PNAC in 2009 across three intakes.
5. 44 candidates were successful, giving a success rate of 49.4%. The success rate in 2009 was lower than the success rate in 2008 but higher than the preceding three years.
6. The 'Unsuccessful' category is broken down by two further groupings; 'Unsuccessful Encouraged to Return' and 'Unsuccessful Question of Return Left Open'. 15 (16.9%) candidates were 'Unsuccessful Encouraged to

Return', and 30 (33.7%) candidates were 'Unsuccessful Question of Return Left Open'.

7. Analysis of significant differences could not be conducted for all the biographical variables due to insufficient numbers of candidates in some categories which would have led to unreliable results. Where it was possible to conduct this analysis, this is reported.
8. Female candidates represented 21.3% (19) of the candidate group and male candidates 78.7% (70) of the candidate group. This is an increase of six female candidates compared to 2008 and in real number terms represents the highest number of female candidates to have attended Senior PNAC or any of the predecessor Chief Officer selection processes.
9. 11 female candidates were successful; a success rate of 57.9% and 33 males were successful; a success rate of 47.1%. The difference between success rates of males and females is not statistically significant.
10. The representation of female candidates at Senior PNAC (19, 21.3%) and now going forward to the Strategic Command Course (11, 25.0%) is higher than the representation of females at the superintending ranks within England & Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland.
11. Candidates from a Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) background represented 5.6% (5) of the candidate group. This is the highest number of BME officers to have attended Senior PNAC and in real number terms is an increase of two BME candidates compared to the 2007 and 2008 candidate cohorts.
12. 40.0% (2) of the candidates from a Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) background were successful compared to 50.0% (42) of the White group. Due to small numbers it was not possible to determine whether a statistically significant difference exists.

13. The representation of candidates from Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) groups at Senior PNAC (5 candidates, 5.6%) and now going forward to the Strategic Command Course (SCC) (2, 4.5%) was greater than the overall representation of BME officers at superintending ranks in the police forces within England & Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland.
14. The '36 – 40 years' age group achieved the highest success rate (4, 100.0%) with the lowest success rate for the '51 – 55 years' age group (0, 0.0%). The average age of successful candidates was 44.7 years compared to an average age of 45.0 years for all candidates.
15. The results suggest that those candidates with more service were less likely to be successful than candidates with fewer years service although the small numbers involved mean this trend should be treated with caution. The average length of service for successful candidates was 22.4 years compared to 23.1 years service for the whole candidate cohort.
16. The success rates of candidate groups based on their highest level of academic attainment indicated that most groups had similar success rates, ranging from 48.1% (13) for candidates with a Degree or equivalent to 57.1% (4) for candidates with O-Levels or equivalent.
17. One (50.0%) of the two candidates, who disclosed that they had a disability, as defined under the Disability Discrimination Act, was successful at Senior PNAC. Three candidates (3.3%) applied for, and were provided with appropriate reasonable adjustments according to their individual needs. One further candidate applied for and received adjustments for restricted mobility which was not classed as a disability.
18. Candidates from 42 separate forces were represented at Senior PNAC including the Police Service of Northern Ireland, the British Transport Police and six Scottish forces. The force with the highest numbers of candidates was the Metropolitan Police Service (11, 12.4%).

19. The one candidate from Northern Ireland was successful (1, 100.0%). Candidates from Scottish forces and Non-Home Office forces had the lowest success rate (25.0%, 3 and 1 respectively). The success rate of candidates from English forces was 56.1% (37).
20. Most candidates (82, 92.1%) indicated that their rank was 'Chief Superintendent'. Of these 52.4% (43) were successful. One of the seven (14.3%) candidates who stated their current rank was 'Superintendent' was successful.
21. Those that stated they had attended Senior PNAC previously had a greater combined success rate (55.9%, 19) than those candidates who were attending Senior PNAC for the first time (45.5%, 25). The difference between success rates based on whether candidates had previously attended Senior PNAC is not statistically significant.
22. The majority of candidates (76.4%, 68) had some involvement with either the National Senior Careers Advisory Service (NSCAS) or the Senior Careers Development Service (SCDS). The group with the highest success rate were those candidates who had been involved with full NSCAS Client Services (28, 60.9%).
23. In each exercise, assessors awarded candidates' an overall exercise mark, which reflected a combination of their performance in the competencies and how well they achieved the overall aims of the exercise. Assessors did this using a six point Exercise Mark Scale ranging from '1' (Very Effective Task Performance) to '6' (Very Ineffective Task Performance).
24. Generally, the distribution of marks across the exercises were in line with the frequencies expected with the exception of the Non-Service Interview where '1' and '2' were the most frequently awarded marks. Similarly, for both the Policing Presentation and Interview and the Media Exercise, the distribution of marks shows that '2' and '3' were the most commonly awarded marks. These distributions indicate that in these exercises the

candidates achieved a slightly higher score profile than would be typically expected.

25. Analysis of the exercise marks achieved by candidates at Senior PNAC show that the mean score for the majority of the exercises was broadly around the mid-point. The Policing Presentation and Interview (2.87) and Non-Service Interview (2.53) had the lowest mean scores which shows that candidates' achieved the highest average performance ratings in these exercises.
26. The inter-relationships between different competencies in the same exercise tended to be higher than relationships between the same competencies in different exercises. This is known as the exercise effect and is a common finding in assessment centre research. The finding reinforces the importance of representing contemporary and job-related tasks, issues and priorities within the exercises.
27. Both candidates and assessors were asked to provide feedback on aspects of the Assessment Centre, including the exercises and the site. 53 candidates (59.5%) and 53 assessors (76.8%) responded to the feedback questionnaires.
28. On average 86.4% of candidates thought the exercises were either 'Relevant' or 'Very Relevant'. When this is broken down further into individual exercises the majority of candidates considered all six exercises to be either 'Relevant' or 'Very Relevant'. The exercise seen to be the most relevant was the Media Exercise (100.0%, 50) and the Negotiating Exercise was seen to be the least relevant exercise with 64.7% (51) of candidates indicating that they thought it was either 'Relevant' or 'Very Relevant'.
29. On average 91.7% of candidates thought the exercises were 'Fair' or 'Very Fair'. Again when broken down by exercise the majority of candidates considered all six exercises to be either 'Fair' or 'Very Fair'. The exercise

seen to be most fair was the Non-Service Interview (97.9%, 47) and the Negotiating Exercise was seen to be the least fair exercise with 82.0% (50) of candidates indicating that they thought it was either 'Fair' or 'Very Fair'.

30. On average 93.0% of assessors thought that the exercises were either 'Relevant' or 'Very Relevant'. On average 95.6% of assessors thought that the issues contained in the exercises were either 'Fair' or 'Very Fair'.
31. Within the questionnaire candidates were asked how satisfied they were with the site used as the location for the Assessment Centre. Of the 53 respondents, 89.1% (51) of candidates were either 'Satisfied' or 'Very Satisfied'.
32. Within the questionnaire assessors were asked if they considered the Bramshill site suitable for the delivery of Senior PNAC, 92.5% (49) of assessors considered the Bramshill site suitable for Senior PNAC.
33. In addition to obtaining the views of candidates and assessors directly involved in the process, a total of 27 different stakeholders and customers visited the site during the delivery of the 2009 Senior PNAC process. These interested parties included; Derek Barnett (Superintendents' Association - President elect), Tessa Brook (Senior Appointments Panel Independent Member), Sir Ronnie Flanagan (Senior Appointments Panel Chair), Everett Henry (NPIA, Head of Equality, Diversity and Human Rights), Bob Hodgson (Independent Equality, Diversity and Human Rights Advisor), Peter Holland (NPIA Chair), Jayne Monkhouse (Superintendents' Association Equality, Diversity and Human Rights Advisor), Peter Neyroud (NPIA Chief Executive), Angela O'Connor (NPIA Chief People Officer), Melanie Roberts (Senior Appointments Panel Secretariat), Bill Skelly (HMIC - Scotland), Andrew Wren (Senior Appointments Panel - Home Office member) and Adrian Wight (Senior Appointments Panel Secretariat).

34. The visitors provided very positive feedback about the contemporary content, fairness, objectivity and robustness of the Senior PNAC process. Many stakeholders also indicated that they were reassured and felt confident that the Senior PNAC selection process was a good test for identifying appropriate police leaders for the future. Details about specific comments and any reports provided by stakeholders and visitors are available on request.